## All-Volume Overview

### Chapter 5

Satellite Launches in the PRC: Hughes

### Chapter Summary

**Optus B2, Apstar 2 Launch Failures: PRC Gains Sensitive Knowledge from Hughes Investigations**

**The Prohibition Against Technology Transfer in Foreign Launches**
- International Traffic in Arms Regulations and the U.S. Munitions List
- Department of Defense Monitoring Role

**Optus B2**
- The Optus B2 Licenses
- The Optus B2 Fails To Achieve Orbit
- Failure Investigation Teams
- Failure Investigation Begins
- Hughes’ Export Administrators Deal with the Licensing Question
- A ‘Political’ Business Solution
- The Optus B3: Hughes’ Efforts to Improve the Long March Continue

**Apstar 2**
- The Apstar 2 License
- The Apstar 2 Failure
- Failure Investigation Teams
- Failure Investigation Schedule
- The Need for a License
- Commerce Department Conference
- Same Fairing Failure Identified by Hughes
- A ‘Political’ Business Solution, Again?
- The Commerce Department Approves Data Release to the PRC
Hughes Tries to Get the PRC to Accept Its Findings ........................................ 51
CIA Analyst Visits Hughes .................................................................................. 56
A ‘Consolidated Solution’ ..................................................................................... 58
Final Failure Investigation Report Released to the PRC by the Commerce Department ... 60
Implementing the ‘Consolidated Solution’ ............................................................ 64
U.S. Government Actions Following the Apstar 2 Launch Failure ......................... 66
Defense Department Assessments of Damage to National Security ....................... 68
  Damage to National Security from the Apstar 2 Failure Investigation ................. 69
  Damage to National Security from the Sharing of Coupled Loads Analysis ........... 72
  Damage to National Security from Providing the PRC with
    Information Concerning Deficiencies in the Fairing, and
    Resultant Improvements to PRC Rockets and Ballistic Missiles .................... 73
  Other Information Learned by the PRC, and Defense Department Reaction ........ 74
State Department Assessments of Damage to National Security .......................... 75
Damage to National Security Identified by the Select Committee’s Technical Consultant .......................................................... 85

CHARLIE TRIE, THE PRC, AND HUGHES ELECTRONICS .................................. 87
FURTHER INVESTIGATION WARRANTED ......................................................... 88
TECHNICAL AFTERWORD: Nose Fairings on Rockets and Ballistic Missiles ........ 90

CHAPTER 6
Satellite Launches in the PRC: Loral

CHAPTER SUMMARY ............................................................................................... 96

INTELSAT 708 LAUNCH FAILURE: LORAL INVESTIGATION PROVIDES PRC WITH SENSITIVE INFORMATION: OVERVIEW OF EVENTS ............................................. 100
  The PRC’s Launch Failure Investigation ............................................................ 107
  The Asia Pacific Telecommunications Insurance Meeting ................................. 107
  The PRC’s Creation of an ‘Independent Review Committee’ ............................ 108
  The Independent Review Committee’s Meetings .............................................. 109
  The Independent Review Committee’s Report ............................................... 110
Substance of the Preliminary Report ....................................................... 110
The Report Goes to the PRC ................................................................. 112
Defense Department Analyst Discovers the Activities
of the Independent Review Committee ............................................... 113
Loral and Hughes Investigate the Matter ............................................. 114
The Aftermath: China Great Wall Industry Corporation Revises Its
Findings on the Cause of the Accident ................................................ 114
U.S. Government Assessments of the Independent Review
Committee’s Report, and Referral to the Department of Justice .............. 115

DETAILS OF THE FAILED LONG MARCH 3B-INTELSAT 708 LAUNCH
AND INDEPENDENT REVIEW COMMITTEE ACTIVITIES ................... 116

Background on Intelsat and Loral ......................................................... 116

Intelsat .......................................................... 116
Loral Space and Communications ....................................................... 117
Space Systems/Loral .......................................................... 118
Intelsat 708 Launch Program ......................................................... 118

The Intelsat 708 Launch Failure ......................................................... 119

Events Leading Up to the Creation of the Independent Review Committee .... 121

The Government Security Committee Meeting at Loral ......................... 124

The Apstar 1A Insurance Meeting ...................................................... 128

The April 1996 Independent Review Committee Meetings in Palo Alto ........ 129

Meeting on April 22, 1996 .............................................................. 129
Meeting on April 23, 1996 .............................................................. 131
Meeting on April 24, 1996 .............................................................. 132

United States Trade Representative Meeting on April 23, 1996 ................. 132

The April and May 1996 Independent Review Committee Meetings in Beijing 134

Meeting on April 30, 1996 .............................................................. 134
Members’ Caucus at the China World Hotel ....................................... 134
Meeting on May 1, 1996 .............................................................. 138

The Independent Review Committee Preliminary Report ....................... 140
Writing the Report .......................................................... 140
Loral Sends the Draft Report to the PRC .......................................... 140
The Contents of the Draft Report ..................................................... 141
Notification to Loral Officials That a Report Had Been Prepared .................. 142
Loral Review and Analysis of the Independent Review Committee Report .......... 143
The Final Preliminary Report is Sent to the PRC ........................................ 144
Another Copy of the Report is Sent to Beijing ............................................. 145
Loral Management Actions After Delivery of the Report to the PRC ................. 146
Defense Department Official Discovers the Activities
of the Independent Review Committee ....................................................... 147
Meeting with the Defense Technology Security Administration .................... 148
Meeting with the State Department ............................................................. 148
Reynard’s Telephone Call to Loral ................................................................. 149
Loral Management Discovers the Independent Review Committee Report Has Been Sent to the PRC ................................................................. 150
Loral’s ‘Voluntary’ Disclosure ........................................................................ 151
Investigation by Loral’s Outside Counsel ....................................................... 151
Loral Submits Its ‘Voluntary’ Disclosure to the State Department ..................... 151
The PRC Gives Its Final Failure Investigation Report .................................... 157
Assessments By U.S. Government Agencies and Referral to the Department of Justice ................................................................. 158
Defense Department 1996 Assessment ............................................................ 158
Central Intelligence Agency Assessment ......................................................... 159
Department of State Assessment ................................................................. 159
Defense Technology Security Administration 1997 Assessment ..................... 159
Interagency Review Team Assessment ............................................................ 160
Outline of What Was Transferred to the PRC .................................................. 161
Independent Review Committee Meeting Minutes ......................................... 161
Independent Review Committee Preliminary Report ..................................... 162
Loral’s Inaccurate Instructions on Releasing Public Domain Information to Foreigners ................................................................. 162
Instructions to the Independent Review Committee
Regarding Public Domain Information ............................................................. 162
State Department Views on Public Domain Information .................................. 164
The Defense Department Concludes That the Independent Review Committee’s Work Is Likely to Lead to the Improved Reliability of PRC Ballistic Missiles .......... 164
The Cross-Fertilization of the PRC’s Rocket and Missile Design Programs .......... 166
The Independent Review Committee Aided the PRC in Identifying the Cause of the Long March 3B Failure ................................................................. 167
The PRC Implemented All of the Independent Review Committee’s Recommendations . 168
The Independent Review Committee Helped the PRC Improve the Reliability of Its Long March Rockets ................................................................. 171

AFTERWORD: U.S. COMPANIES’ MOTIVATIONS TO LAUNCH SATELLITES IN THE PRC .............................................................. 172

CHRONOLOGY OF KEY EVENTS ................................................................. 176

TECHNICAL AFTERWORD: Technical Aspects of Technology Transfer During the Loral Failure Investigation: Background ......................... 194

CHAPTER 7
Protecting Sensitive Information at PRC Launch Sites

CHAPTER SUMMARY .......................................................................................... 218

PROTECTING SENSITIVE INFORMATION AT PRC LAUNCH SITES: BACKGROUND .......................................................... 220
U.S.-PRC Bilateral Agreement ............................................................................. 220
Export Licenses for PRC Launching of U.S. Satellites ........................................ 220
Defense Department Monitors .......................................................................... 222

UNAUTHORIZED ACCESS ALLOWS OPPORTUNITIES TO GAIN INFORMATION CONCERNING U.S. SATELLITES AND OTHER CONTROLLED TECHNOLOGY ......................................................... 222

INADEQUACY OF CURRENT SAFEGUARDS ..................................................... 227

SAFEGUARDING U.S.-BUILT SATELLITES AND U.S. ROCKET TECHNOLOGY AT PRC LAUNCHES .................................................... 237
Country-to-Country Agreements ........................................................................ 237
Export Licenses .................................................................................................. 237
THE DEFENSE DEPARTMENT’S RESPONSIBILITIES FOR SAFEGUARDING U.S. TECHNOLOGY AT LAUNCHES ................. 238

DEFICIENCIES OBSERVED IN THE CURRENT SYSTEM ................. 239
   U.S.-PRC Technical Discussions Occur Prior to the Issuance of Export Licenses ........................................ 239
   Technology Transfer Control Plans and Security Plans Vary Throughout the Space Industry ................................ 239
   Temporary Assignments of Defense Department Monitors Disrupt Continuity of Launch Site Security ..................... 240
   An Inadequate Number of Defense Department Monitors Is Assigned to PRC Launches ..................................... 242
   Uneven Prior Technical Experience of the Defense Department Monitors ....................................................... 244
   Inadequate Headquarters Review of Monitor Reports ......................................................................................... 245
   Lack of Headquarters’ Support ...................................................................................................................... 246
   Lack of Intermediate Sanction Authority ........................................................................................................ 247
   Conflicting Industry Priorities ...................................................................................................................... 249
   Satellite Manufacturers, Not the Defense Department, Supervise Site Security Personnel ................................. 250
   Reliance on Private Contractor Security Is Inadequate ..................................................................................... 250
   Insufficient Numbers of Security Guards at PRC Launch Sites ..................................................................... 252

CORRECTING SECURITY DEFICIENCIES ........................................ 253
   The 1999 Defense Authorization Act ........................................................................................................... 254

EXCERPTS FROM DEFENSE DEPARTMENT MONITORS’ REPORTS OF SECURITY LAUNCHES OF U.S. SATELLITES ............. 255